Assessing for Value: Equity, Quality & Student Learning

Gianina Baker, Ph.D.
Assistant Director, National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment

www.learningoutcomesassessment.org
NILOA’s mission is to discover and disseminate effective use of assessment data to strengthen undergraduate education and support institutions in their assessment efforts.

- Surveys
- Web Scans
- Case Studies
- Focus Groups
- Website
- Occasional Papers
- Resources
- Newsletter
- Presentations
- Transparency Framework
- Featured Websites
- Accreditation Resources
- Assessment Event Calendar
- Assessment News
- Measuring Quality Inventory
- Policy Analysis
- Environmental Scan
- Degree Qualifications Profile
- Tuning
We are pleased to announce the release of a new NILOA book, Degrees that Matter: Moving Higher Education to a Learning System Paradigm. The book is available now.

We are delighted to release our thirty-fourth occasional paper where authors, Ruth C. Stobnick and Mark C. Nicolais, work to develop a portrait of current assessment professionals. Click here to read the occasional paper.

In the News | Archive

As California Goes?
Fri, Jul 06, 2018 - 08:00 am
Paul Fain in Inside Higher Education

California’s state legislature recently passed a performance-based formula for its community colleges that centers around measures of student success. Opponents of the bill argue that such legislation unintentionally punishes the institutions and students who need it the most while proponents state that the bill, in fact, makes Institutions more accountable for the success of such students. Another article in Inside Higher Ed, States Struggle to Close Degree-Attainment Gaps, acknowledges such gaps.

Is the Work College Model the ‘Wave of the Future’ for Reaching Underserved Students?
Fri, Jul 06, 2018 - 08:00 am
Allie Bidwell for the National Association of Student Financial Aid Administrators (NASFAA)

“Earning to Learn,” a new report from the American Enterprise Institute (AEI), states that the nation’s nine work colleges can serve as examples for liberal arts colleges to better equip students with the job skills employers demand. Work colleges assess student learning through work assignments that evaluate students’ learned skills. These assignments also help create work transcripts that students can offer alongside their academic transcripts.

This Is What Georgia Tech Thinks College Will Look Like in 2040
Fri, Jul 06, 2018 - 08:00 am
Beth McMurtrie for the Chronicle of Higher Education

Rafael L. Bras, Georgia Tech’s provost and executive vice president for academic affairs, discusses a newly released report from Georgia Tech’s Commission on Creating the Next in Education aimed at providing recommendatons for public universities in the year 2040 and beyond. The report makes various
Goals for today:

- Discuss the relationship between equity and assessment
- Introduce the concept of culturally responsive assessment
- Hear reflections from others on how they approach culturally responsive assessment approaches at your institution

Video: [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CI_g7AWJx-A&feature=youtu.be](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CI_g7AWJx-A&feature=youtu.be)
CURRENT STUDENT EXPERIENCE OF HIGHER EDUCATION
HOW WE WORK and ORGANIZE OUR DATA

- Courses
- Assignments
- Programs
- General Ed
- Employment
- Co-Curriculum
- Starting Institution
- Transfer Institution
WHAT DOES A DEGREE REPRESENT?

seat time?
Carnegie credit hours?
grade point averages?
required courses?
clinical hours?

All of these suggest what degrees represent in terms of numbers.

What do degrees represent in terms of learning?
1. Most institutions have statements of student learning aligned throughout the institution.
2. Greater use of authentic measures of student learning (classroom assignments, rubrics, capstones)
3. Strong focus on more support for faculty
4. Communicating information about student learning remains a target of opportunity.
Assessment for Student Success is driven by...

- Accreditation (Regional & Program)
- Desire to improve student learning
- Growing emphasis on Equity
  - Disaggregation of evidence of learning by various groupings of students
Finding from NILOA’s Survey of Provosts 2017

“Assessment continues to be driven by both compliance and improvement, with an emphasis on equity.”
Background

- **NILOA Case Study:** North Carolina A&T State University: A Culture of Inquiry
- **NILOA Case Study:** Texas A&M International University: A Culture of Assessment INTEGRATEd
- **NILOA Report:** Using Assessment Results: Promising Practices of Institutions That Do It Well
  - Becoming more transparent with assessment processes and results and with sharing promising practices externally. North Carolina A&T State University’s desire to communicate to students and the higher education community at large led to opportunities for student involvement in assessment through the Wabash Provost Scholars Program.
Background


Four main findings:

1. Assessment work at Minority-Serving Institutions is focused primarily to serve internal interests and needs.
2. External pressures drive the assessment work of MSIs, even though they are more likely to use assessment results for internal improvement.
3. While driven by the same external factors, and using results in similar fashion, sub-categories of MSIs employ different approaches to assess student learning.
4. While driven by similar ends, subcategories of MSIs use assessment to address different institutional needs and interests.
Historically Black College and University (HBCU) Collaboration for Excellence in Educational Quality Assurance (CEEQA).

"...seeks to help address accountability measures while being true to HBCU missions and culturally relevant assessment approaches"

- Knowing who [their] students are and will be
- Committing to frank, hard dialogues about the climate for underserved students ... with the goal of effecting a paradigm shift in language and actions
- Investing in culturally competent practices that lead to success of underserved students—and of all students
- Setting and monitoring equity-minded goals—and devoting aligned resources to achieve them
- Developing and actively pursuing a clear vision and goals for achieving the high-quality learning necessary [for] careers and [for] citizenship, and therefore essential [for a bachelor’s] degree
- Expecting and preparing all students to produce culminating or Signature Work at the associate (or sophomore) and baccalaureate levels to show their achievement of Essential Learning Outcomes, and monitoring data to ensure equitable participation and achievement among underserved students
- Providing support to help students develop guided plans to achieve Essential Learning Outcomes, prepare for and complete Signature Work, and connect college with careers
- Identifying high-impact practices (HIPs) best suited to your students and your institution’s quality framework of Essential Learning Outcomes, and working proactively to ensure equitable student participation in HIPs
- Ensuring that Essential Learning Outcomes are addressed and high-impact practices are incorporated across all programs, including general education, the majors, digital learning platforms, and co-curricular or community-based programs
- Making student achievement—including underserved student achievement—visible and valued (2015a, 5–10)
1. To meet the goal of improving student learning and authentically documenting what students know and can do, a culturally responsive approach to assessment is needed.

2. There is an assumption at play within the field of assessment that while there are multiple ways for students to learn, students need to demonstrate learning in specific ways for it to count.

Research Question: How consequential can assessment be to learning when assessment approaches may not be inclusive of diverse learners?
“To be consequential, assessment information needs to be actionable, focused on the needs and interests of end users, embedded in the ongoing work of teaching and learning, available in understandable forms, customized, and supported by institutional leaders.”
“Assessment, if not done with equity in mind, privileges and validates certain types of learning and evidence of learning over others, can hinder the validation of multiple means of demonstration, and can reinforce within students the false notion that they do not belong in higher education.” (Montenegro & Jankowski, 2017)
“…that while learners may take multiple paths to and through learning, they must demonstrate their knowledge and skills in the same way.” (p. 5)
Culturally Responsive

“an action-based, urgent need to create contexts and curriculum that responds to the social, political, cultural, and educational needs of students; it is affirmative and seeks to identify and institutionalize practices that affirm indigenous and authentic cultural practices of students” (Khalifa, Gooden, & Davis, 2016, p. 1278)

Elements of Culture

- Implicit
- Explicit
- Cognitive

Culture

Responsive
“What is needed is not to help learners conform to the ways of higher education, thus reinforcing inequities and expectations based on ideologies the students may ascribe to, but to empower students for success through intentional efforts to address inequality within our structures, create clear transparent pathways, and ensure that credits and credentials are awarded by demonstration of learning, in whatever form that may take.” (p. 16)
Fostering culturally responsive assessment

1. Student Learning Outcome Statements
2. Assessment Approaches
3. Use of Assessment Results
Fostering culturally responsive assessment

Student Learning Outcome Statements

### Specific, actionable learning outcome statements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WHO</th>
<th>Will do WHAT</th>
<th>To BE ABLE TO</th>
<th>As Demonstrated By</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Year Students</td>
<td>Attend orientation</td>
<td>Identify 3 resources on campus they might use…</td>
<td>Completing a survey at the end of the program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Health Educators</td>
<td>Participate in a training session</td>
<td>Define 3 strategies to improve personal health</td>
<td>Developing a presentation outline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resident Advisors</td>
<td>Complete a workshop</td>
<td>Demonstrate effective conflict resolution strategies</td>
<td>Evaluation during mock roommate conflict simulations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Specific, actionable learning outcome statements

- Students who work as referees in club sports, who have attended the referee training, will be able to demonstrate *conflict resolution skills* in simulated events.

- Students who participate in new student orientation will be able to identify two academic support services available on campus by writing them on the exit survey.

- Students who are disabled and participate in self-advocacy training will be able to articulate their accommodation needs to their instructors.

- Students who participate in a leadership retreat will demonstrate **effective communication skills** by presenting their annual goals to the group.
Learning Frameworks

- Learning frameworks allow us to all agree on the learning we are striving and designing towards, not how we will get there, but to align our practices.
- It sets us up to allow students and others to put forward evidence to be validated by shared evaluative criteria.
- How should learning outcomes frameworks be used to reflect and inform cocurricular professional development programs and experiences for students who are considering multiple career pathways?

Common Learning Frameworks:
1. Degree Qualifications Profile: DQP
2. LEAP Essential Learning Outcomes: LEAP ELOs
3. Tuning (History, Communications, etc.)
4. Employability Skills Framework
5. Common Employability Skills (NACE)
6. Common Core State Standards
7. Beta credential framework
8. Your own institutional learning outcomes
9. Council for the Advancement of Standards (CAS)
10. International frameworks
Decolonizing the curriculum

In 2016 November, the ACPA Governing Board adopted the Strategic Imperative for Racial Justice and in 2017 July expanded it to include Decolonization. Our commitment to this work includes agreement with six operational truths.

1. All forms of oppression are linked.
2. Racism and colonization are real, present, enduring, intersectional, and systemic forms of oppression.
3. Racism and colonization have informed the experience of all of us in higher education.
4. Advocacy and social change require us to work to dismantle racism and colonization in higher education.
5. Our collective education, research and scholarship, advocacy, and capacity will create positive change in higher education.
6. We believe in and have hope for our individual capacity, desire, and drive to grow, learn, and change.

We encourage each of our members and all of our colleagues in student affairs and higher education to reflect on this essential question, “What is my place in doing racial justice and decolonization work?”

ACPA is committed to helping our members develop competencies to engage in this work within their respective roles and responsibilities in student affairs. Please use and share our resources at www.myacpa.org/strategic-imperative-racial-justice-decolonization
The 2017 grant will focus on the development and implementation of a single learner record across a broad number of American colleges and universities. The CSRs seek to **capture, record, and communicate learning when and where it happens** in a student’s higher education experience. This includes learning outcomes from courses, program and degrees, as well as experience they have outside the classroom that help develop their career ready skills and abilities.

[https://www.aacrao.org/signature-initiatives/comprehensive-learner-record](https://www.aacrao.org/signature-initiatives/comprehensive-learner-record)
The Difference Student Affairs Makes

When we asked students to think of a specific, critical incident or moment that had changed them profoundly, 4 of 5 chose a situation or event outside the classroom.

Light, 2001, *Making the Most of College*
“At perhaps no time in recent decades has student affairs been more central to a quality university experience and the learning therein. Yet we also face unprecedented economic challenges that are almost ubiquitous at national, state, and local levels. As a result, and in stark contrast to its centrality, student affairs as a profession and function within typical higher education settings is perhaps in more danger than ever before of being reduced, collapsed with other functions, or eliminated entirely.” (Bresciani, 2012, p. 1)

Although primary data-oriented roles and responsibilities for IR, IT, and student affairs are somewhat siloed, these units are contributing to institution-wide goals of improving student success.
# Transformative Learning Record (STLR)

College students grow and transform through both academic and non-academic experiences at the University of Central Oklahoma (UCO). Students' academic transcripts display their aptitude in their Discipline Knowledge, but how can they track and display their growth in other important areas?

UCO's Student Transformative Learning Record (STLR) is a second transcript that records students' growth and development across the other three of UCO's Core Six Tenets listed below.

For example, students might:

- learn how to work well in teams with people whose opinions differ from their own;
- develop leadership skills as president of a student organization;
- improve their ability to interact positively and appropriately with co-workers, customers, and others from different countries and cultures in their classes;
- find out how to contribute as productive citizens to their local communities, the nation, and the world through volunteering;
- or might practice solving unsolved problems and devise creative solutions while doing independent research.

STLR is designed to encourage students to reflect on their experiences, review feedback from faculty and staff members. Students draw on these experiences and reflect on different viewpoints and experiences that they can share with potential employers, graduate schools, or others who might highlight their most employable strengths.

**STLR - Because College is About More Than A Degree.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>By Tenet</th>
<th>Transformation</th>
<th>Integration</th>
<th>Exposure</th>
<th>Not Achieved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global &amp; Cultural Competencies</td>
<td>The experience led to the student's new identity as a global citizen, and she/he now seeks interactions and growth from diverse communities and cultures.</td>
<td>The student's perspective has expanded to valuing different cultural worldviews and she/he is able to articulate a sense of identity in a global context.</td>
<td>The student displays an openness to learning about global and cultural differences and/or took part in an activity where she/he was exposed to worldviews of other cultures.</td>
<td>The student has not yet provided evidence of openness to or awareness of the concepts listed in exposure for this tenet.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# IUPUI Experiential and Applied Learning Record

IUPUI validates all achievements presented on this Record and it is an official University document. Assessment occurs within each program responsible for the achievement and validation occurs in the Office of the Registrar. Each achievement is maintained in a centralized system. Students do not personally enter any information onto this record. Each Achievement is tied to an IUPUI Principle of Co-Curricular Learning as reflected at the bottom of the record. Note that achievements reflected by semester may have occurred during only a portion of the semester.

## Summary of IUPUI Achievements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diversity</th>
<th>Global</th>
<th>Internship</th>
<th>Leadership</th>
<th>Research</th>
<th>Service</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 Semesters</td>
<td>3 Semesters</td>
<td>560 Hours</td>
<td>2 Semesters</td>
<td>400 Hours</td>
<td>180 Hours</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Achievement Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2013 and Before</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spring</td>
<td>Spring</td>
<td>Spring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam H. Jones Community Service Scholar</td>
<td>IU Simon Cancer Research</td>
<td>Habitat For Humanity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Estate - Spring</td>
<td>Undergraduate Research Conference</td>
<td>Honors Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fall</td>
<td>Fall</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam H. Jones Community Service Scholar</td>
<td>Habitat For Humanity</td>
<td>Undergraduate Research Conference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Service Leader - Spring</td>
<td>Honors Research</td>
<td>Service Corps</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fall</td>
<td>Fall</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam H. Jones Community Service Scholar</td>
<td>Habitat For Humanity</td>
<td>Honors Research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Service Leader - Spring</td>
<td>Undergraduate Research Conference</td>
<td>Service Corps</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fall</td>
<td>Fall</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## IUPUI Principles of Co-Curricular Learning

- Core Communication
- Critical Thinking
- Depth/Breadth/Adaptiveness
- Integration of Knowledge
- Interpersonal Development
- Interpersonal Development
- Understanding Society & Culture
- Values & Ethics

Official record page 1 of 2 created on <mm/dd/yyyy>
# ELON EXPERIENCES TRANSCRIPT

**Global Engagement • Internships • Leadership • Service • Undergraduate Research**

> Elon University validates all information presented on a student’s Elon Experiences Transcript. Violation occurs within each program and is subsequently investigated in a centralized system. Students do not personally write or experience any experience notes on their Elon Experiences Transcript. The Elon Experiences Transcript is an official document of Elon University.

**Name:** Jane Sally Doe  
**Degree:** AB - Bachelor of Arts  
**Major(s):** English  
**Minor(s):** Political Science

## Study Abroad

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semester</th>
<th>Course Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Winter 2013</td>
<td>Science in London/ILR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winter 2012</td>
<td>Studies in Costa Rica/ILP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## LEADERSHIP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semester</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2013</td>
<td>Resident Student Association</td>
<td>Vice-President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall 2012</td>
<td>Alpha Chi Omega</td>
<td>New Member Educator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall 2012</td>
<td>SPARRS</td>
<td>Peer Educator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2013</td>
<td>SPARRS</td>
<td>Peer Educator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2013</td>
<td>Orientation</td>
<td>Resident Staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall 2012</td>
<td>Alpha Chi Omega</td>
<td>Vice-President</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Volunteer Service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2013</td>
<td>Elon Service Day</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2013</td>
<td>Cummings High School</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2013</td>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2012</td>
<td>Blood Drive</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2012</td>
<td>Boye and Oriel Club</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall 2012</td>
<td>Alpha Chi Omega</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall 2012</td>
<td>Alpha Chi Omega</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall 2012</td>
<td>Habitat for Humanity</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2013</td>
<td>ElonTHON</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Undergraduate Research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semester</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2012</td>
<td>Elon Research Forum</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fall 2012</td>
<td>Research in English</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2014</td>
<td>Research in English</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Internships/CO-OP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Semester</th>
<th>Internship Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summer 2012</td>
<td>Washington Center Internship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2012</td>
<td>Internship with Gallup</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Hours:** 160 hours

**Total Hours:** 260 hours
Experiential Learning Requirement

As part of Elon University’s academic requirements, all students must complete at least two experiences that fulfill their Experiential Learning Requirement (ELR). These experiences are presented on both a student’s academic transcript and Elon Experiences Transcript, but are officially maintained as part of their academic transcript.

To fulfill Elon’s ELRs, students engage in a process that includes preparation, action, and reflection to develop the habits of mind required to transfer knowledge between experiences and classes. Elon University’s mission is to develop students as socially responsible global citizens. The ELR can be met through deep engagement and reflection in any of the five ELR Experiences.

The Elon Experiences Transcript maintains a record of student experiences beyond the ELR. Most ELR experiences will appear on the Elon Experiences Transcript; however, not all items featured on the Elon Experiences Transcript earn credit toward the ELR.

Elon Experiences

Experiential learning prepares students for lives of meaningful work and service through out-of-the-classroom experiences. By engaging students in opportunities that integrate knowledge and experience, experiential learning fosters an understanding and lifelong appreciation for learning.

Elon’s five signature experiential learning programs, the Elon Experiences, include the following:
1. Global Engagement: Study Abroad/Study USA
2. Internships
3. Leadership
4. Service
5. Undergraduate Research

Collectively, these programs reflect important values that add to the total college experience and prepare students as lifelong learners and global citizens.

1. Global Engagement: Study Abroad/Study USA

The Isabella Cannon Global Education Center is home to Elon’s nationally recognized study abroad and study USA program. Elon is #1 in the country among master’s-level institutions for the percentage of students who study abroad. Study abroad and study USA experiences completed during a semester or quarter and other non-credit global engagement experiences are validated by the Global Education Center and included on the Elon Experiences Transcript.

2. Internships

Elon’s Student Professional Development Center connects students with internship opportunities in the community and across the country. Students prepare for professional roles through these experiences and as a result are more likely to be hired upon graduation. Internship and Co-Op experiences completed for course credit are included on students’ Elon Experiences Transcript in addition to internships submitted by students and validated with employers by the Student Professional Development Center.

3. Leadership

The Center for Leadership provides advanced leadership programming and training open to all students. The Center also works with a broad range of student organizations and validates key leadership positions for the Elon Experiences Transcript. All leadership experiences validated as part of the Elon Experiences Transcript reflect that students have been leading other students.

4. Service

The Kernodle Center for Service Learning and Community Engagement supports service connections and individual student connections to service opportunities in the community. Each year, students, faculty, and staff demonstrate Elon’s strong commitment to service through their work in the community. Service experiences with community partners, through Elon courses, campus organizations, or completed independently are submitted to the Kernodle Center by students or organization leaders for validation and inclusion on the Elon Experiences Transcript.

5. Undergraduate Research

Students work collaboratively with a faculty mentor on research projects. These research experiences prepare students for graduate school and employment opportunities. All research experiences validated by the Undergraduate Research Program for inclusion on the Elon Experiences Transcript are research activities beyond what is completed as part of regular coursework.
Fostering culturally responsive assessment

Assessment Approaches

INTEGRATIVE SENIOR CAPSTONE PROJECT
Law of initiative fatigue

- Enthusiasm
- Overload
- Burnout

Time, resources, and energy of staff

Number of old, continuing, and new initiatives
Figure 14. Extent of involvement in national, regional, and local learning related initiatives.
Faculty are working to create a curriculum that intentionally builds in integrated learning opportunities over time for students to apply and practice as well as transfer their knowledge and skills through assignments, in and out of courses.
NILOA’s Response

1. Inviting faculty applications (with draft assignment)

2. Bringing the group together for a day-long meeting

3. Working in 5-6 person, facilitated “charrettes” to review one another’s assignments and give feedback.
Lessons Learned from Assignment Charrettes

1. Assignments are intellectual work worth sharing.

2. Classroom work yields high-quality, actionable evidence.

3. Alignment as the challenge and the payoff.

4. Assignments to promote equity goals for student success.
   - Eighty percent of NILOA respondents found that the experience of sharing assignments “helped me more clearly see my assignment through my students’ eyes.”
Transparency in Assignments

Transparency in Teaching and Learning: https://www.unlv.edu/provost/teachingandlearning

**Purpose**
- Skills you’ll practice by doing this assignment
- Content knowledge you’ll gain from doing this assignment
- How you can use these in your life beyond the context of this course, in and beyond college

**Task**
- What to do
- How to do it (Are there recommended steps? What roadblocks/mistakes should you avoid?)

**Criteria**
- (Are you on the right track? How to know you’re doing what’s expected?)

**Annotated examples of successful work**
- (What’s good about these examples? Use the checklist to identify the successful parts.)
“We all have these things that we’re subconsciously looking for when we grade assignments...that we’re regularly disappointed with. And then you get to poking around in your assignments and realize that nowhere in there did you ever really ask them to demonstrate those things.”
“We know that for students to persist, complete, and achieve success in college, **the learning environment matters**. Students need to feel integrated into academic and social culture, but **integration is not enough. They must be engaged**. The more engaged students are in learning environments, the more likely they are to complete, learn, and be satisfied. Further, student beliefs about their academic ability influence their success in education, **and faculty interactions sit at the intersection of reinforcing or debunking student beliefs**.” (Jankowski, 2017)
Mapping has emerged as a key strategy for examining the alignment of the different elements of learning environments towards shared learning outcomes as well as to better understand where to assess and document learning.

Mapping is about the process of seeing relationships.

By mapping collectively and collaboratively, those involved are able to unpack assumptions about their own and others’ roles and contributions to the learning of students.
Examples

Metro State College of Denver
Curriculum Mapping Template
2008-09

Each required course should be linked with at least one Learning Objective and one level* by entering the appropriate letter(s) in the relevant cell. Programs are free to include other courses as appropriate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Objective 1</th>
<th>Learning Objective 2</th>
<th>Learning Objective 3</th>
<th>Learning Objective 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XXX1234</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX2345</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX3456</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX4567</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX5678</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX6789</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XXX7890</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Levels: - These are stated from the student's perspective and tied to Bloom's Taxonomy as much as possible.
V = discover (gain knowledge, comprehend information)
P = practice (apply knowledge gained to real situations, analyze issues and questions)
D = demonstrate (prepare a work product - exam, paper, presentation, etc. - that represents knowledge gained, application of same and synthesis or evaluation of knowledge and ideas)

* a course might be identified as offering students the opportunity to do more than one level
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Introductory Course</th>
<th>Research Methods</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course A</th>
<th>Laboratory/Practicum Course</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course B</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course C</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course D</th>
<th>Capstone Course</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SLO 1: Disciplinary knowledge base (models and theories)</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 2: Disciplinary methods</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 3: Disciplinary applications</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 4: Analysis and use of evidence</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 5: Evaluation, selection, and use of sources of information</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 6: Written communication skills</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 7: Oral communication skills</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity / Values</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 8: Disciplinary ethical standards</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 9: Academic Integrity</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 10: Interpersonal and team skills</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 11: Self-regulation and metacognitive skills</td>
<td>Introduced</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Reinforced</td>
<td>Mastery / Assessed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample Curriculum Map (Level of Skill)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Center for University Teaching, Learning, and Assessment
http://uwf.edu/cutla/
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Introductory Course</th>
<th>Research Methods</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course A</th>
<th>Laboratory/Practicum Course</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course B</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course C</th>
<th>Advanced Content Course D</th>
<th>Capstone Course</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SLO 1: Disciplinary knowledge base (models and theories)</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 2: Disciplinary methods</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 3: Disciplinary applications</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Exam Questions</td>
<td>Class Project</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical Thinking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 4: Analysis and use of evidence</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td>Lab Paper</td>
<td>Class Presentation</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 5: Evaluation, selection, and use of sources of information</td>
<td>Annotated Bibliography</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td>Lab Paper</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 6: Written communication skills</td>
<td>Reflection Essays</td>
<td>Class Presentation</td>
<td>Poster Session</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td>Term Paper</td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 7: Oral communication skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity / Values</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 8: Disciplinary ethical standards</td>
<td>Reflective Paper</td>
<td>IRB/ACUC Proposal</td>
<td>Reflective Paper</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 9: Academic integrity</td>
<td>Class Assignments &amp; Exams</td>
<td>Exams &amp; Term Paper</td>
<td>Class Assignments &amp; Exams</td>
<td>Exams &amp; Term Paper</td>
<td>Exams &amp; Term Paper</td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 10: Interpersonal and team skills</td>
<td>Peer Review of Team Skills</td>
<td></td>
<td>Project Client Feedback</td>
<td>Peer Review of Team Skills</td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 11: Self-regulation and metacognitive skills</td>
<td>Class Assignments &amp; Exams</td>
<td></td>
<td>Class Assignments &amp; Exams</td>
<td>Exams &amp; Term Paper</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capstone Portfolio</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Center for University Teaching, Learning, and Assessment

Sample Curriculum Map (Assignments & Embedded Assessments)

http://uwf.edu/cutla/
## Mapping Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Outcomes</th>
<th>General Education Courses that support the learning outcomes</th>
<th>Courses that address specific outcomes</th>
<th>Co-curricular elements that support specific outcomes</th>
<th>Possible career paths related to the map</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning Outcome 1</td>
<td>General education courses that support the learning outcomes</td>
<td>Courses that address specific outcomes</td>
<td>Co-curricular elements that support specific outcomes</td>
<td>Possible career paths related to the map</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Outcome 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4. Degree-level relationship map
## Mapping Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Outcomes</th>
<th>Prior Learning</th>
<th>Courses</th>
<th>Other Required Courses, Recommended Electives</th>
<th>Activities and Experience That Provide Support</th>
<th>Work-Based Learning Experiences</th>
<th>Certifications and Licensures</th>
<th>Possible Careers</th>
<th>Learner Identified</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning Outcome 1</td>
<td>Prior learning that is accepted in relation to specific outcomes</td>
<td>Courses that address specific outcomes</td>
<td>Other courses that support and reinforce specific outcomes</td>
<td>Co-curricular elements that support specific outcomes</td>
<td>Employment and other experiences that reinforce specific outcomes</td>
<td>Possible certifications connected to the outcomes</td>
<td>Possible career paths related to the map</td>
<td>Elements identified by learners as supporting learning outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Outcome 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment
Making Learning Outcomes Usable & Transparent
Learning Away Photo Contest

Nature’s Beauty: Alek Kohn; Summer 2017 experience in the Dominican Republics

Entries:

- The photo contest is available to all UMR students who completed a learning away experience (for credit or not-for credit as part of their UMR experience) during Fall 2016, Winter Break 2016/2017, Spring 2017, or Summer 2017.

OVERVIEW

This Learning Life is a campus-wide competition celebrating the Illini learning community on our beautiful Urbana-Champaign campus. We want to see what learning looks like through your eyes! We invite you to sharpen your visual communication skills, and get prizes and recognition for it, and also get that great, personal image that will help you stand out from the crowd.

Digital storytelling has become an essential skill to communicate ideas clearly and effectively. We hear from employers all the time that they are seeking people across all disciplines who have that creative mindset. Whether you’re in mechanical engineering or crop sciences, social work or microbiology, business or modern languages, if you know how to tell a story, reveal something of your inner world in a single image, or think critically about the great human endeavor to know that is learning, we want to give you the opportunity to challenge yourself. We hope your insights and perspectives will also inspire a greater awareness of the intrinsic value of the on-campus experience, here at Illinois.

All currently enrolled UIUC students are invited to enter an image, a caption and a brief narrative text to accompany the image. Entries will be judged by a multidisciplinary panel for:

- Relevance to the This Learning Life themes
- Originality
- Visual Impact
## Student Affairs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Outcome 1</th>
<th>Learning Experience 1</th>
<th>Learning Experience 2</th>
<th>Learning Experience 3</th>
<th>Learning Experience 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning Outcome 1</td>
<td>Exposure/Participation</td>
<td>Reinforce/Development</td>
<td></td>
<td>Attainment/Achievement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Outcome 2</td>
<td>Reflective Assignment</td>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>Project Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Outcome 3</td>
<td>Stand alone</td>
<td>Coupled with a course</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
University of Iowa

University of Wisconsin-Madison

https://vp.studentlife.uiowa.edu/priorities/grow/

https://www.talent.wisc.edu/home/HideATab/WiGrow/tabid/418/Default.aspx
High expectations for performance

Extended investment of time and effort

Experiencing diversity

Frequent feedback

Public demonstration of competency

Faculty and peer interaction

Reflecting and integrating learning

Relevance of learning through real-world applications


First-Year Seminars and Experiences

Many schools now build into the curriculum the first-year seminar or other programs that bring small groups of students together with faculty or staff on a regular basis. The highest-impact first-year experiences play a strong emphasis on critical inquiry, frequent writing, information literacy, collaborative learning, and other skills that develop students’ conceptual and practical competencies. First-year students can also transfer students with cutting-edge questions to scholarship and with faculty mentors’ own research.

Undergraduate Research

Many colleges and universities now emphasize courses and programs that help students explore career-life experiences, and provide them with opportunities to develop and enhance these skills. Undergraduate research, however, has been consistently and increasingly popularized both as a science discipline. With strong support from the National Science Foundation and the research community, scientists are releasing their courses to connect key concepts and questions with student’s own study and active involvement in systematic investigation and research. This helps to inspire students with a lively curiosity questions, empirical observation, cutting-edge technologies, and the sense of excitement that comes from working in career-important disciplines.

Diversity/Global Learning

Many colleges and universities now emphasize courses and programs that help students explore career-life experiences, and provide them with opportunities to develop and enhance these skills. Undergraduate research, however, has been consistently and increasingly popularized both as a science discipline. With strong support from the National Science Foundation and the research community, scientists are releasing their courses to connect key concepts and questions with student’s own study and active involvement in systematic investigation and research. This helps to inspire students with a lively curiosity questions, empirical observation, cutting-edge technologies, and the sense of excitement that comes from working in career-important disciplines.

ePortfolios

Many colleges and universities now emphasize courses and programs that help students explore career-life experiences, and provide them with opportunities to develop and enhance these skills. Undergraduate research, however, has been consistently and increasingly popularized both as a science discipline. With strong support from the National Science Foundation and the research community, scientists are releasing their courses to connect key concepts and questions with student’s own study and active involvement in systematic investigation and research. This helps to inspire students with a lively curiosity questions, empirical observation, cutting-edge technologies, and the sense of excitement that comes from working in career-important disciplines.

Service Learning, Community-Based Learning

Many colleges and universities now emphasize courses and programs that help students explore career-life experiences, and provide them with opportunities to develop and enhance these skills. Undergraduate research, however, has been consistently and increasingly popularized both as a science discipline. With strong support from the National Science Foundation and the research community, scientists are releasing their courses to connect key concepts and questions with student’s own study and active involvement in systematic investigation and research. This helps to inspire students with a lively curiosity questions, empirical observation, cutting-edge technologies, and the sense of excitement that comes from working in career-important disciplines.
Degree Qualifications Profile,
Tuning, QA Commons
Fostering culturally responsive assessment
EIA Designation:
1. Effectively communicating a coherent narrative of institution-level assessment of student learning
2. Communicates work to various audiences by connecting multiple points of evidence

http://learningoutcomesassessment.org/TransparencyFramework.htm
Co-sponsors: Voluntary System of Accountability (VSA), the National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment (NILOA), and the Association of American Colleges and Universities (AAC&U). VSA is a joint initiative of the American Association of State Colleges and Universities (AASCU) and the Association of Public & Land-grant Universities (APLU).
Co-sponsors: Voluntary System of Accountability (VSA), the National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment (NILOA), and the Association of American Colleges and Universities (AAC&U). VSA is a joint initiative of the American Association of State Colleges and Universities (AASCU) and the Association of Public & Land-grant Universities (APLU).
Co-sponsors:  Voluntary System of Accountability (VSA), the National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment (NILOA), and the Association of American Colleges and Universities (AAC&U). VSA is a joint initiative of the American Association of State Colleges and Universities (AASCU) and the Association of Public & Land-grant Universities (APLU).
Learning Outcome Assessment
Communication Continuum

- Compliance posting of outcomes & select (favorable) results
- Oversharing of easy to measure outcomes & results, just to do something
- More tailored posting of outcomes, by program/major experience & results for different audiences
- More complete picture of all the places learning occurs, posting outcomes in student affairs/services & results for different audiences
- Nuanced, tailored framework for communicating outcomes, improvements, in comprehensive, student-focused, culturally responsive way
# Learning Paradigm ➔ Learning Systems Paradigm

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution-Focused</th>
<th>Learner-Centered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning assessed for a sample of students</td>
<td>Learning demonstrated for every student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normative approach</td>
<td>Responsive approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summative</td>
<td>Formative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structured (seat time)</td>
<td>Adaptive/flexible offerings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implicit outcomes and connections</td>
<td>Explicit outcomes and connections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual courses</td>
<td>“our courses”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silos/territories</td>
<td>Integrated and collaborative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning occurring in the institution</td>
<td>Learning happening everywhere</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[www.learningoutcomesassessment.org](http://www.learningoutcomesassessment.org)
Another Way to Think about It:
Assessment as Good Questions about T&L

- What do **we** want our students to know and be able to do?
- What opportunities do **we** provide for developing these abilities? Are our courses “aligned”?
- How do **we** know if and how well students are achieving course and program goals? What is the evidence?
- How do **we** use that evidence to strengthen teaching, course design, curriculum, and other aspects of the student experience?
- How can **we** work together on these questions, building a collaborative culture of evidence and improvement?
NILOA/CAS Call for Case Study Participants: Equity in Assessment

- Provide examples of practices that ensure assessment of student learning is applicable, responsive, and fair to all student populations
- Institutions engaged in equitable assessment efforts and interested in sharing processes and practices through a case study

www.learningoutcomesassessment.org
Reflect

What do you see as the relationship between equity and assessment?

How do we assist/create experiences that will elicit student demonstration, not limit demonstration, of a specific learning outcome?

How do you plan to continue these conversations on your own campus?
   a. What challenges do you foresee?
   What opportunities can you leverage to get this moving forward?

What resources/tools do you need to do so?

www.learningoutcomesassessment.org
Communicating effectively about student learning remains a challenge.

Use of assessment results is increasing, but documenting improvements in student learning and the quality of teaching falls short.

Equity is an important consideration in assessment work, but underemphasized in data use.

Opportunities exist to integrate professional development with assessment efforts.
Questions

Email us: niloa@education.illinois.edu

National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment
University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
51 Gerty Drive, Suite 196 CRC, MC-672
Champaign, IL 61820

Assignment Library: www.assignmentlibrary.org
Degree Qualifications Profile: www.degreeprofile.org
NILOA Website: www.learningoutcomesassessment.org
Join Our Email List: goo.gl/DDU56q